

Report of the Independent Committee

Recommendations for the Distribution of Funds
Held by Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha and Collected in
Response to the October 27, 2018 Shooting

Delivered to Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha,
Congregation Dor Hadash and New Light Congregation

Thursday, February 13, 2020

D'var Torah (words of Torah)

Delivered at the Sunday, November 17, 2019 Committee Meeting

Parshat (weekly Torah reading) Chayei Sarah (The life of Sarah) provides the first Jewish example for responding to death and its aftermath. The lessons seem especially timely, on the first yahrzeit (yearly Hebrew anniversary of a death) of our own tragedy.

At the beginning of the Parsha, Sarah passes away, and Abraham comes “to eulogize Sarah and weep for her.” Overcoming the paralysis of his grief, Abraham negotiates with the local Hittites to purchase land in Hebron as a burial place for Sarah. He then buries Sarah in what would become the final resting place for almost all of the forefathers and foremothers. This is a story of pain, and exemplary lovingkindness toward a life’s partner.

Abraham then pivots from the mourning to finding a bride for his son Isaac. Abraham sends a servant to seek a woman from Abraham’s hometown who would embody the same trait of lovingkindness that he hoped would someday characterize all of his descendants. The servant comes back with Rebekah, who marries Isaac and later gives birth to the next generation of Abraham and Sarah’s descendants.

For Abraham, the efforts to honor the past through Sarah’s burial, and to build the future by finding a bride for Isaac, were seamless. Both were rooted in chesed (lovingkindness).

One year ago, our community suffered a tragedy that included the loss of not just one life but eleven. The loss was felt most keenly by family, but also by the whole community, and the Jewish people beyond Pittsburgh. Everyone responded as Abraham did, with lovingkindness.

Those most distant, unable to participate locally, sent in contributions. This Committee was entrusted with the sacred responsibility of recommending the allocation of these contributions based on donor intent, and a profound desire to deepen the comity that has always characterized the Jewish community of Pittsburgh. Like Abraham, we were charged with looking backward, to take care of the victims and their families, and to look forward, to continue to build a community based on kindness and shared vision.

Near the end of the Parsha, the Torah reports on Abraham’s own death. Little noticed is the Torah’s next verse, which reports that his sons Isaac and Ishmael together buried him in the plot Abraham purchased years before, when he buried Sarah. Think of it, the two brothers who had been competing for Abraham’s love – the one sent away and the one promised to be a forebear of the Jewish people – overcame their jealousies to pay their last respects to Abraham. The children exhibited the lovingkindness that Abraham had modeled years before.

Our community in Pittsburgh has been a shining example for world Jewry of a close-knit group drawn even closer by tragedy. Let us commit to continuing to learn from Abraham, Isaac and even Ishmael about responding to tragedy with lovingkindness.

Contents

- The Independent Committee..... 1
- Total Funds Available for Distribution 3
- Relevant Factors Informing Committee Work..... 3
 - Listening to Victims’ Families..... 4
 - Studying Precedent..... 4
 - Taking Account of Needs and Other Available Resources..... 5
 - Considering Individuals Within the Same Recipient Category 6
 - The Relationship between Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha, Congregation Dor Hadash and New Light Congregation..... 7
 - Respecting Donor Intent..... 7
- Recommendations for Fund Distributions..... 9
 - Compassion Payments to Individuals 10
 - Payments to Congregations..... 10
 - Funds Set Aside to Honor First Responders..... 12
 - Funds Set Aside for Memorialization..... 12
- Additional Recommendations 13
 - Earned Interest 13
 - Gifts received by Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha after April 30, 2019..... 13
- Dedication 14

The Independent Committee

The Independent Committee was formed in November 2018 to recommend the distribution of funds collected through the Jewish Federation of Greater Pittsburgh's *Victims of Terror* Fund. Due to the unusual, high-profile nature of the task and a desire to include broad community perspectives, the Committee was created and chartered to function independently from the Jewish Federation.

The Committee met eleven times between November 2018 and April 2019. During that time the Committee developed trusting inter-personal relationships and collectively gained considerable understanding of the legal, ethical and practical intricacies of distributing funds collected in response to a tragedy. As stated in the Committee's March 2019 report on the distribution of Jewish Federation *Victims of Terror* funds:

The Committee sought both to do the right thing and to do things the right way. The Committee worked to ensure that those aims characterized both the interactions of the Committee with others and discussions and deliberations within the Committee itself. Meetings were uniformly thoughtful and respectful, with Committee members remaining sufficiently open-minded that positions were sometimes changed after lengthy discussion.

The *Victims of Terror* funds were distributed by April 2019. The Committee's full report on this work is available for download from the Jewish Federation's [website](#).

A second pool of funds donated in response to the October 27th, 2018 shooting was received by Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha. Motivated by the belief that at least a portion of these funds were intended to benefit all three affected congregations and victims regardless of congregational affiliation, and seeking to benefit from the Committee's experience and existing relationships, in late August 2019 representatives from Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha Congregation, Congregation Dor Hadash and New Light Congregation contacted Committee leadership to request Committee involvement in the distribution of these funds. After consultation and unanimous consent of all Committee members – notably including Committee representatives from all three congregations directly affected by the tragedy – the Committee agreed to the request.

The Committee met seven times between September 2019 and January 2020 to develop the recommendations outlined in this report. As before, the Independent Committee took seriously at every step of the process its responsibility to formulate careful and considered recommendations to the congregations for contributions made by thousands of donors from around the world.

Despite many similarities which allowed the Committee to lean heavily on prior experience, this new task presented some notable differences.

First, the most important difference may have been the Committee's charge. In its earlier work, the Jewish Federation had expressed from the beginning its intention to abide by Committee recommendations, but that was not the case for these funds. Instead, the Committee was asked to make recommendations regarding the distribution of funds, without any commitment by the congregations to accept those recommendations.

Second, despite considerable effort by many, including leaders of the Jewish Federation and Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha Congregation, to provide a complete and accurate understanding of the facts of the matter, much of the media coverage of the tragedy excluded any mention of its effects on Congregation Dor Hadash and New Light Congregation. As tenants of the Tree of Life Synagogue, each of these congregations saw their own congregants murdered and physically and emotionally injured and suffered other significant harm as a result of the attack that day. As such, it was generally understood by the Committee that many individuals who sent money to Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha probably were motivated by the suffering - and desire for healing - of all victims of this tragedy regardless of their congregational affiliation. Therefore, while the Committee was asked to make recommendations regarding the distribution of certain funds held at Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha, it considered itself to be working on behalf of all three affected congregations, a position that was strongly endorsed by the leadership of all three congregations.

Third and lastly, the Committee, when initially formed to develop a distribution plan for the Jewish Federation's *Victims of Terror* fund, consisted of seven "independent" members. That group quickly invited leaders of the affected congregations and of the Jewish Federation to attend all meetings and to engage actively in discussions and deliberations. Despite their technical "observer" status, these individuals were full, active participants and made important contributions to the Committee's work. Given the positive experiences from that earlier work and the heightened need for the active participation of all three congregations in this stage of work, the Committee functioned with these additional members from the very beginning.

The Independent Committee members are:

David Shapira, chairman of Giant Eagle and chair of the Committee
Meryl Ainsman, chair, Jewish Federation of Greater Pittsburgh
Susan Brownlee, former executive director of The Fine Foundation
Barbara Caplan, co-president, New Light Congregation¹

¹ Barbara Caplan replaced Stephen Cohen as New Light representative to the Committee in November 2019. The Committee is grateful for Steve's contribution during his time of service.

Jared Cohon, president emeritus of Carnegie Mellon University
Steve Halpern, president of Woodland Management and Jewish Federation board member
Mark Nordenberg, chancellor emeritus of the University of Pittsburgh
Charles Perlow, chairman of McKnight Realty Partners and Jewish Federation board member
Jon Pushinsky, past president, Congregation Dor Hadash
Nancy Rackoff, estates and trusts attorney at the Eckert Seamans law firm
Sam Schachner, president, Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha Congregation

Throughout its work, the Committee received invaluable support from Joshua Donner, executive director of the Shapira Foundation, and Jeffrey Finkelstein, president/CEO of the Jewish Federation of Greater Pittsburgh.

Total Funds Available for Distribution

The Committee was asked to make recommendations for the distribution of \$5,454,421 sent to Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha between October 27, 2018 and April 30, 2019 in response to the October 27, 2018 shooting. This time period was established based on the fact that donations began arriving within hours of the shooting, and that after April 30, 2019, Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha established strong donation protocols to ensure that all contributions associated with the tragedy received after that date would include a clear designation by the donor about how those funds should be used, obviating the need for advice on fund distribution.

Relevant Factors Informing Committee Work

There is no single “right way” to distribute donations collected after such a tragedy. The Committee’s words from its March 2019 report on the distribution of the Jewish Federation’s *Victims of Terror* funds are equally applicable to this exercise:

The very existence of [these dollars] reflects the best of human qualities because the donations can be seen as expressions of love, generosity, compassion and a desire to help in the healing process. Still, in a very real sense, no matter how many dollars might have been collected, the total never would have been enough. No amount of money can compensate for the loss of a loved one’s life; no amount of money can fully compensate for a life that has been violently knocked off course and suddenly filled with unanticipated and daunting new obstacles; and, no amount of money can ever completely heal our hearts or our communities. In that very practical sense, the task of distributing monies from a victims’ fund such as this one inevitably involves doing the best possible job of allocating limited resources among competing needs.

The Committee sought to do the best job possible by following legal doctrine, thoughtfully applying precedent, taking account of its own experiences in developing a distribution plan for the Jewish Federation's *Victims of Terror* funds, considering the particulars of this situation, being informed by Torah (Jewish law and wisdom), seeking an amicable resolution that would promote communal healing, and relying heavily on the collective wisdom and good judgment of Committee members.

What follows is a discussion of the major factors that shaped the Committee's recommendations.

Listening to Victims' Families

In the course of this work, the Committee engaged with the families of those killed and with those worshippers who sustained serious physical injuries. Although the Committee had done so during the prior distribution of Jewish Federation *Victims of Terror* funds, the Committee felt it was important to listen again so that it could take account of any changes in attitudes or circumstances. The Committee held an in-person meeting to which representatives from the families of all of the worshippers who had been killed or seriously wounded were invited and also solicited additional written statements from this same group.

Through this process, the Committee learned first-hand about the families' continuing sense of loss and the obstacles and fears that both surviving family members and seriously wounded worshippers will need to overcome in rebuilding their lives. These interactions had great impact on Committee members, who continue to be inspired by the personal strength, concern for others, and thoughtfulness of these remarkable individuals.

Studying Precedent

In its earlier work, the Committee had reviewed extensive written documentation and media coverage of the distribution processes and decisions from a number of victim funds established with charitable donations collected after other incidents of mass violence. This precedent was helpful and instructive, although not controlling. The Committee applied what it learned to the particular facts and context of this situation.

Most instructive was the framework established for the distribution of the Jewish Federation's *Victims of Terror* funds earlier in 2019. This experience gave the Committee direct, first-hand experience with process, legal issues, and the particular challenges of distributing charitable dollars given in response to incidents of mass violence. Further, because those funds were collected in response to the same tragedy, the context is nearly identical.

In making these recommendations, Committee members borrowed heavily from that prior process, reviewing carefully, and often citing the reasoning and recommendations from its

March 2019 report. At the same time, the Committee took great care to deliberate on each question it faced, making sure to evaluate the applicability of precedent, gather new information and study the current context.

Taking Account of Needs and Other Available Resources

Distributions from this fund obviously can be an important source of support, as individuals and congregations continue with their ongoing efforts to recover from this tragedy. Yet as already discussed, no amount of money can fully compensate for loss of life, serious wounds, and congregational damage. The task of distributing these funds, then, calls for doing the best possible job of allocating limited resources among competing needs and taking account of other available resources.

In responding to this challenge, the Committee looked to its earlier distribution of \$6.3 million in non-donor designated funds collected through the Jewish Federation *Victims of Terror Fund*. The Committee largely adopted the same need categories and looked at how much was distributed to each of those needs from that fund. These prior distributions are summarized as follows:

- More than \$5.3 million – 85% of total funds – was distributed as *compassion payments to individuals and families*. The majority of these funds went as payments to the families of those killed and to seriously wounded worshippers. Because the injuries suffered by the two seriously wounded worshippers were life-changing, with physical challenges and ongoing costs that cannot be accurately predicted, the Committee chose to make their Compassion payments the same amount as payments to families of those who lost their lives. Compassion payments were also made to individuals who experienced a special form of trauma from having been physically trapped in the building during the shooting. Though their circumstances were less dire, payments were made to individuals who were on the site at the time of the attack but who were not trapped in the building. Finally, compassion payments were made to police officers who were physically wounded while risking their lives on that day.
- The balance - \$950,000 or 15% - was distributed as *grants to support congregations and community*. \$650,000 was distributed to the three congregations affected by the tragedy. Congregation Dor Hadash and New Light Congregation each received \$100,000; Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha received \$450,000. These distributions were intended to aid in the healing of the congregations as well as the individuals that comprise their membership. The larger amount to Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha was made in recognition of the need for funds to support the repair or reconstruction of the badly damaged Synagogue building, so that Jewish life can once again flourish at the site. \$300,000 was set aside to support Memorialization, Commemoration and Education for community healing and safety.

Furthermore, the Committee made statements in its first report that are relevant to the distribution of funds covered by this report. Notably the Committee wrote in its March 2019 report (emphasis added):

In distributing 85% of the total fund [as compassion payments to victims], the Committee is expressing [the belief that] these compassion payments should be made expeditiously, while accessing other revenue sources and gaining an understanding of other communal needs will take time. (p13)

It also was the intention of the Committee, by directing the great bulk of its distributions to individual victims, to leave the congregations with somewhat greater freedom to focus on congregational needs as they devise distribution plans for the donations that have come to them. (p11)

The Committee also took care to consider developments in the launch of the [10.27 Healing Partnership](#), whose mission is to foster a sense of community well-being by providing opportunities for reflection, support, and connection for individuals and their loved ones impacted by the October 27, 2018 attack and for others who experience hate-induced trauma. The 10.27 Healing Partnership serves those directly impacted by the shooting – victims, loved ones and survivors, congregations, emergency response personnel and organizations providing support to the impacted – as well the greater Pittsburgh community by providing a peaceful, welcoming environment for private and group conversations and meetings, behavioral health resources, wellness classes, educational programming, and connections to mental health services. The Committee wishes to express gratitude to the U.S. Department of Justice for the time, expertise and funding through the Victims of Crime Act and the Antiterrorism and Emergency Assistance Program to help form and fund the 10.27 Healing Partnership, which will go a long way to help those most directly affected as well as the many thousands in our greater Pittsburgh community who have or will experience a diagnosable traumatic response to the shooting.

[Considering Individuals Within the Same Recipient Category](#)

In the case of individuals within the same recipient categories, the Committee does not recommend differential awards based on financial or other circumstances of either an individual victim or a victim's family. It is the view of the Committee that all lives are precious and there is no basis for valuing differently each of the lives that was lost. The Committee similarly does not feel capable or inclined to place differing values on the challenges faced by worshippers in other victim categories, and similarly recommends that all members of each victim category receive identical payments. Furthermore, it is the strongly held belief of the Committee that compassion payments made from these dollars should be distributed using the

same definitions and groupings of recipients as was used with the Jewish Federation *Victims of Terror* Fund.

The Relationship between Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha, Congregation Dor Hadash and New Light Congregation

It has already been noted that the Committee worked for all three congregations. This point cannot be overemphasized and is worth restating.

Also, as has already been noted, despite considerable efforts by leaders of the Jewish Federation and Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha Congregation to provide a complete and accurate understanding of the facts of the matter, a substantial percentage of media coverage of the tragedy did not mention the effects of the tragedy on Congregation Dor Hadash and New Light Congregation, both of which, as tenants in the Tree of Life Synagogue, saw their own congregants murdered and physically and emotionally injured on that day. It has been said that the event was “branded” with the name “Tree of Life” thereby unintentionally deflecting attention from the losses suffered by these other two congregations.

It was generally understood by the Committee that some organizations and individuals who sent money to Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha had in mind the suffering - and desire for healing - of all victims of this tragedy regardless of their congregational affiliation. Along those same lines, it is presumed that many organizations and individuals who sent money to Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha had in mind the need for congregational healing and renewal without the knowledge of the two other congregations.

With this sensitive issue in mind, and motivated by the belief that the healing and renewal of all three congregations requires doing so together, the leadership of all three congregations expressed to the Committee a strong desire that these funds support all victims of this tragedy, and that the dollar amount of compassion payments to victims and families should not differ based on their congregational affiliation. Leadership similarly felt it crucial to consider the needs of all three congregations – as communities and institutions – in the distribution of these funds.

The Committee unanimously and strongly commends the leadership of all three congregations for this position while adopting these recommendations as its own.

Respecting Donor Intent

Honoring donor intent is a principal responsibility of those charged with stewarding charitable gifts.

An important step in the process of honoring the intent of donors is to review all of the contributions to determine which were accompanied by comments that expressed how the

donor intended the funds to be used. The Committee honored this information where it was available.

Most often, as is typical in such collections, individual contributions were not accompanied by comments, or were accompanied by comments that expressed caring sentiments but gave no direction regarding the intended fund use. In recommending the distribution of those funds, the Committee looked to descriptive language available to donors that may have given them a sense of how their donated funds would be used.

More than \$900,000 was contributed electronically through the Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha website, with an additional \$2.9 million contributed by cash or check received by the congregation or given directly through First National Bank. Special language posted on the Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha website stated:

Sorrow, Support and Strength for the Tree of Life Victims and Synagogue

We are deeply moved by the outpouring of support for our synagogue from our community and people across the country and around the world in the wake of the horrific anti-Semitic attack of October 27, 2018. We will continue to mourn our lost congregants, even as we honor their memories by healing, growing and strengthening the congregation they loved. We deeply appreciate the many offers of assistance in support of the victims' families and to help rebuild the Tree of Life synagogue. Your support proves that love is truly stronger than hate. Thank you!

Depending on when they accessed the website, many donors were further asked to direct their gift to one of two funds:

Tree of Life Victims and Family Account

Tree of Life Synagogue Account: Rebuilding the Synagogue.

An additional \$1.3 million was contributed through a single GoFundMe drive. Well publicized in the media and organized by Shay Khatiri, an Iranian-born graduate student at Johns Hopkins University, this fund titled *Tree of Life Synagogue Victims* included the essential language “*This fundraiser is meant to help the congregation with the physical damages to the building, as well as the survivors and the victim's families.*”

Among the noteworthy features of the Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha website and GoFundMe language are these:

- The clear and prominent use of the word *victim* in the title and body of both statements and designation options makes clear that contributions would be used to address the needs and healing of this tragedy's victims.

- The clear and prominent mention of *rebuilding* and reference to the synagogue in both statements and designation options makes clear that contributions would be used to help meet the cost of repairing or rebuilding the damaged building.
- It is the judgment of the Committee that congregational renewal is an intended and appropriate use of funds, based on the following observations: The inclusion of the word “strength” in the website statement title; the sentence “We will continue to mourn our lost congregants, even as we honor their memories by healing, growing and strengthening the congregation they loved” in the website statement; and, the understanding that donors chose to contribute directly to the congregation or to Tree of Life-branded channels in contrast to the fund organized by the Jewish Federation.

The Committee took great care to understand and honor donor intent when such information could be established and to ensure that each type of distribution it has recommended is compatible and consistent with published language associated with primary contribution channels.

Recommendations for Fund Distributions

The Committee recommends that the \$5,453,421 in funds be distributed according to the following table. Further explanation is provided in the sections that follow.

Distribution Recommendations	
Compassion Payments to Individuals and Families	
Payments to the families of those killed and to seriously wounded worshippers	\$3,024,231
Payments to individuals trapped in the building	\$215,162
Payments to individuals on the premises during the attack	\$23,905
Total Compassion Payments to Individuals and Families	\$3,263,298
Grants to Support Congregations and Community	
Congregation Dor Hadash	\$240,197
New Light Congregation	\$240,457
Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha Congregation	\$1,275,871
Funds set aside to honor first responders	\$200,000
Funds set aside for memorialization	<u>\$233,598</u>
Total, Grants to Support Congregations and Community	\$2,190,123
TOTAL DISTRIBUTIONS	\$5,453,421

Compassion Payments to Individuals

The Committee recommends that the majority of donations - \$3,263,298 - be distributed as compassion payments to those who were most tragically affected. That group includes the families of the eleven deceased individuals; the two individual worshippers who suffered serious physical wounds requiring inpatient hospitalization; the nine individuals known to have been trapped inside the building during the shooting; and those worshippers who, though not trapped in the building, were on the premises at the time of the attack.

The Committee recommends the largest share of compassion payments - \$3,024,231 in total - go to the families of the eleven deceased and to the two individual worshippers with serious physical wounds.

To be clear, payments to the seriously wounded worshippers themselves and to the families of the worshippers who were killed are not viewed by the Committee to be compensation for what are irreparable losses. For some, the payments will help cover practical expenses, such as funeral costs, medical bills or lost income, although distributions from victim funds such as this one are given without any limitations on their use. Furthermore, the Committee hopes that these payments will serve as a comforting reminder of the expressions of compassion that came from thousands of people around the world.

The Committee also recommends the distribution of \$215,162 to the nine individuals who were trapped inside the building during the horrific shooting, fearing for their own lives and, in some cases, watching relatives and friends being murdered. The Committee believes that those upon whom this special form of trauma had been inflicted and who, as a result, will have special human needs, should receive compassion payments.

Though their circumstances were less dire, the Committee also recommends that payments from a much smaller pool of funds - \$23,905 - be made to individuals who were on site at the time of the attack. These funds will be distributed to the six individuals who came forward and were verified for the distribution of Jewish Federation *Victims of Terror Fund* compassion payments as having been physically present on the property but not inside the building on the morning of October 27, 2018 between 9:45am when the shooting began and approximately 10:15am when police took control of the site.

These \$3,263,298 in compassion payments to victims includes \$631,994 in contributions explicitly directed by donors toward this purpose.

Payments to Congregations

The Committee recommends a total of \$1,756,525 be distributed to the three congregations affected by the tragedy. The members of these congregations have special human needs, since

they were intended targets of the attack, and those killed and seriously injured came from within their midst.

The Committee recommends the distribution of \$240,197 to Congregation Dor Hadash, \$240,457 to New Light Congregation, and \$1,275,871 to Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha.

It has been said that the murdered worshippers represented the heart and soul of their congregations. These payments to the congregations reflect that the Committee seeks to aid in the healing and renewal of the congregations as well as the individuals that comprise their membership, and that the congregations themselves are better able to assess these specific needs. Also factored into these distributions is the knowledge that these congregations now are incurring additional expenses, and the payments will allow these congregations to focus on healing and renewal with a lessened burden of active fundraising to cover anticipated and unanticipated operating expenses. The Committee does not intend for congregations to use these dollars to make additional compassion payments to victims.

The larger distribution to Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha is in recognition of the fact that the Congregation bears the principal burden of the repair or reconstruction of the badly damaged building as a place to which all three congregations can return, if they choose to do so. This recommendation is clearly consistent with intended fund uses of the two primary means for making donations, and the Committee feels strongly that restoring vibrant Jewish life, in one form or another, at the site of the shooting is critical to individual, congregational and communal healing and resiliency.

The tragedy of October 27, 2018 cannot be fully understood, nor can full physical and emotional healing occur without serious consideration being given, by the congregations and their members, to the building where the attack occurred. The Tree of Life building, an older building, sustained substantial damage. A major capital repair and restoration project will be costly and complex in the physical sense and will be taxing on the congregations and their members.

Typically, after a traumatic incident such as this, many survivors and worshippers will not want to return to a building that looks or feels the way it did on that day. There may be a need for substantial redesign. The amount distributed here will not support all of this work but could hopefully be used thoughtfully to supplement other funds available and raised for that purpose.

These recommendations include \$197 specifically directed by donors to be allocated to Dor Hadash Congregation, \$457 specifically directed by donors to be allocated to New Light Congregation, and \$425,871 in contributions specifically directed by donors toward reconstruction of the damaged synagogue building.

Funds Set Aside to Honor First Responders

As a step toward promoting communal and congregational healing and renewal, the Committee recommends that \$200,000 be set aside to go toward the purchase of life-saving emergency equipment in honor of the many first responders who acted on that day.

In Jewish history there are too many tragic examples of situations in which those who had a duty to protect failed to step forward and discharge that duty. On October 27, 2018, there was no such failure to respond. The Committee feels strongly that it is both permissible and important to honor those who stepped forward when called to help, protect and to heal, including emergency first responders from various local, state and Federal agencies, healthcare and social services professionals, and Jewish burial society volunteers.

The Committee recommends that these funds be transferred to the City of Pittsburgh with the expectation that the Director of the Public Safety Department, in consultation with the Mayor, will purchase life-saving equipment to better position first responders to respond quickly and effectively to future mass casualty events. In this way, the personal efforts of those who responded to the shooting at the Tree of Life Synagogue will be honored in the best way the Committee can imagine: By helping fellow first responders save lives in the future.

Funds Set Aside for Memorialization

It is impossible to imagine that this community could move forward without honoring the individual victims. The Committee recommends that \$233,598 be set aside to support the future creation of one or more memorials to the direct victims of this tragedy.

The Committee is not expressing an opinion on the location, timeline for construction, or any other attributes of the memorial or memorials. Nor does the Committee envision that these dollars are sufficient to do justice to the task at hand. Additional funds will be required.

However the Committee feels strongly that the development of a fitting memorial to the victims requires a thoughtful and inclusive process. The Committee is aware of instances where good processes have led to memorials that helped loved ones and communities move forward.

The Committee recommends that funds go to a project or projects that have used strong processes to secure input from the families of the eleven worshippers who were killed and other relevant constituencies. The Committee also recommends these funds should be held in a special account at the Jewish Federation of Greater Pittsburgh, and that the eventual use of these funds be determined with the approval of the presidents of the three directly affected congregations - Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha, Congregation Dor Hadash and New Light Congregation.

This recommendation includes \$33,598 explicitly directed by donors for this purpose.

Additional Recommendations

In the course of its work, the Committee developed the following additional recommendations.

Earned Interest

Accounts holding the dollars in question have earned interest that is not reflected in the totals discussed in this report. On the disposition of this earned interest, the Committee recommends:

- Any interest earned on funds already segregated by use should go to that use. (For example, interest earned in the building fund should be directed to reconstruction.)
- All other interest should be used to increase compassion payments to worshippers on a pro rata basis.

Gifts received by Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha after April 30, 2019

Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha received additional contributions in response to the October 27, 2018 shooting after April 30, 2019. It is understood that these gifts, which are not included in the total covered by this report, all carry clear donor intent for either building reconstruction or victim payments, and that the congregation stopped accepting contributions intended for victims on December 31, 2019.

Guided by the principle that no victim or family should receive differing compassion payments based on congregational affiliation, the Committee recommends that gifts designated for victims received between May 1, 2019 and December 31, 2019 be used to increase the compassion payments to worshippers described in this report on a pro rata basis.

Dedication

For each person involved in the Committee's work, this service came to be seen as a privilege, the chance to contribute to something constructive in the wake of an unspeakable tragedy. We are grateful to the leadership of the three congregations and to the thousands of donors for granting us this special opportunity.

We dedicate this report, as we did our prior work, to the many victims of this tragedy, as well as the emergency first responders, healthcare professionals and Jewish burial society volunteers who bravely answered their own call-to-service. We especially remember the worshippers who lost their lives or were seriously wounded:

Joyce Fienberg z"l
Dr. Richard Gottfried z"l
Rose Mallinger z"l
Dr. Jerry Rabinowitz z"l
Cecil Rosenthal z"l
David Rosenthal z"l
Bernice Simon z"l
Sylvan Simon z"l

Daniel Stein z"l
Melvin Wax z"l
Irving Younger z"l

Daniel Leger
Andrea Mallinger Wedner

The independent members of the Committee further dedicate this report to the representatives of the three congregations who served with them on this Committee: Sam Schachner from Tree of Life*Or L'Simcha, Jon Pushinsky from Congregation Dor Hadash, and first Steve Cohen and then Barbara Caplan from New Light Congregation.

These remarkable individuals stand as inspiring examples of selfless leadership grounded in the best of Jewish values. None of them could have imagined the challenges they would face when they assumed their leadership positions. Yet all four rose to the occasion, carefully considering the needs of others even while effectively representing the interests of their own constituencies. They individually and collectively showed an unwavering commitment to achieving the best possible outcome for everyone through negotiation and compromise. For these four, "doing the right thing" meant being open to others' narratives and acknowledging multiple truths. Even when they did not agree on substance, they always held a respectful tone. They represent the best of Pittsburgh and the best of what volunteer leadership can mean.